A merciful death for the “earliest bilaterian”,

Vernanimalcula

Stefan Bengtson^{a,*}, John A. Cunningham^b, Chongyu Yin^c, and Philip C.J. Donoghue^{b*}

^aDepartment of Palaeozoology and Nordic Center for Earth Evolution, Swedish Museum of Natural History, Box 50007, SE-104 05 Stockholm, Sweden

^bSchool of Earth Sciences, University of Bristol, Bristol BS8 1RJ, UK

^cInstitute of Geology and Key Laboratory of Stratigraphy and Paleontology, Chinese Academy of Geological Sciences, Beijing, 100037, China

*Authors for correspondence (email: stefan.bengtson@nrm.se; phil.donoghue@bristol.ac.uk)

SUMMARY Fossils described as *Vernanimalcula guizhouena*, from the nearly 600 million-year-old Doushantuo Formation in South China, have been interpreted as the remains of bilaterian animals. As such they would represent the oldest putative record of bilaterian animals in Earth history, and they have been invoked in debate over this formative episode of early animal evolution. However, this interpretation is fallacious. We review the evidential basis of the biological interpretation of *Vernanimalcula*, concluding that the structures key to animal identity are effects of mineralization that do not represent biological tissues, and, furthermore, that it is not possible to derive its anatomical

reconstruction on the basis of the available evidence. There is no evidential basis for interpreting *Vernanimalcula* as an animal, let alone a bilaterian. The conclusions of evolutionary studies that have relied upon the bilaterian interpretation of *Vernanimalcula* must be called into question.

INTRODUCTION

In 2004 a fantastic animal fossil crept into the scientific literature. *Vernanimalcula guizhouena* was reported from nearly 600 million-year-old Neoproterozoic (Ediacaran) phosphorites of the Doushantuo Formation in Guizhou, southern China (Chen, Bottjer, et al. 2004). Reconstructed as a flatulent “whoopee cushion” (Fig. 1), this broadly circular and flattened organism was interpreted to possess a protruding mouth region leading to a pharynx, a straight gut with an expanded mid region and glands, and an anus. It had a paired coelom. Sensory pits adorned its anterior margin. The animal was small, up to about 200 μm in diameter. It was hailed as the first bilaterian animal in the fossil record, the “small spring animal” following the winter of the Neoproterozoic glaciations.

This concept of *Vernanimalcula* has drawn criticism, at the most fundamental level. It has been contended that interpreted biological structures are layers of geological mineralization deposited on organic matter in decayed microfossils (Bengtson and Budd 2004; Donoghue and Purnell 2009; Xiao et al. 2009, 2010; Cunningham et al. 2012). In spite of the evidence that the reported tissues were artefacts, *Vernanimalcula* has attracted widespread interest for its conceived evolutionary significance. The original paper by Chen, Bottjer, et al. (2004), has attracted more than 160 citations (Supporting Information: Table 1), among

which *Vernanimalcula* has been assigned a pivotal role in animal evolution (Bottjer 2005), including the origin of swimming (Vargas and Aboitiz 2005), bilateral symmetry (Sarnat and Flores-Sarnat 2005; Corballis 2009), the circulatory system (Sarnat 2008), eyes (Nilsson 2004), and even cancer (Saul and Schwartz 2007). In particular, its diminutive size has been cited as giving a decisive push to ideas featuring animal origins in meiofauna-sized creatures (Isaak 2007; Giere 2009).

Given this contrast between concerns over the veracity of the interpretation of *Vernanimalcula*, and the burden of evolutionary significance that has been placed upon this interpretation, we provide a review of its evidential basis, as given in the original descriptions (Chen, Bottjer, et al. 2004; Chen, Oliveri, et al. 2004) and in a recent study (Petryshyn et al. 2011) purporting to confirm the anatomy of *Vernanimalcula*.

LAYERED TISSUES OF INTERPRETATION

Vernanimalcula has been interpreted to preserve a mouth, pharynx, gut, glands, anus, paired coeloms, and an array of sensory pits on its external surface, much of which preserved to a cellular, even subcellular level of fidelity (Chen, Bottjer, et al. 2004; Chen, Oliveri, et al. 2004). There is no doubt that fossilization via mineral replication of biological structure occurs in this deposit: multicellular algae and the putative ‘fossil embryos’, which have recently been reinterpreted as reproductive stages of unicellular protists (Huldtgren et al. 2011), both preserve subcellular structures (Xiao et al. 1998; Hagadorn et al. 2006; Xiao and Schiffbauer 2008; Huldtgren et al. 2011; Cunningham et al. 2012; Schiffbauer et al.

2012). However, none of these fossils are precise lithographs of their original biological selves; all show evidence of decay prior to mineral replication of biological structure and the mineral infilling of spaces left after biological tissues have decayed. A significant effort has been expended in characterising these different phases of mineralization in the Doushantuo fossils in order to constrain their biological and systematic interpretation (Xiao and Knoll 2000; Xiao and Schiffbauer 2008; Cunningham et al. 2012; Schiffbauer et al. 2012).

The process of fossilizing soft tissues through the medium of apatite minerals (calcium phosphates), which characterises the Doushantuo embryo-like fossils and the putative bilaterian, is among the best known of all. Paradoxically, decay is necessary for soft-tissue fossilization, since although microbes (alongside autolytic processes) are the principal vectors of the decay, mineral replication of soft tissues is microbially mediated (Briggs 2003; Raff et al. 2008). However, there is no clear spatial dichotomy between the mineral impregnation of biological substrates, such as animal tissues, and the growth of later diagenetic minerals on the resulting organic or inorganic templates. These two phases of mineralization can, however, be distinguished by their microstructure (Fig. 2). Soft-tissue replication is invariably associated with sub-micrometer scale crystals whose orientation reflects the fabric of the organic matrix. Later diagenetic mineralization not associated with an organic matrix is characterised by coarser crystals growing perpendicularly from substrates, forming a characteristic fibro-normal to spherulitic/botryoidal texture (Cunningham et al. 2012; Schiffbauer et al. 2012).

Vernanimalcula was described to preserve layered ecto-, meso, and endothelial tissues and organs to a cellular or subcellular level (Chen, Bottjer, et al. 2004; Chen, Oliveri, et al. 2004). The primary reason for challenging this interpretation was that the layering is characteristic of generations of void-filling diagenetic mineralization that does not reflect original biological structure (Bengtson and Budd 2004). Putative cell boundaries were in that context reinterpreted as cracks propagated in the directions of the fibro-normal crystals (Fig. 3). Spherulitic structures interpreted originally as sensory organs, glands, pharynx, and a mouth (Chen, Bottjer, et al. 2004) are comparable to spherulitic fans of mineral crystals that nucleate on irregularities on the overgrown surfaces (Figs 2–4).

Chen and colleagues ignored the indications of diagenetic origin (Chen, Oliveri, et al. 2004) and instead built onto their case with further unique anatomical, cellular, and subcellular features avowedly seen in the fossils. Their recent reconsideration in light of new specimens assigned to *Vernanimalcula* concludes, however, as did Bengtson and Budd (2004), that the structures identified as cellular layers were formed by diagenetic growth of apatite into voids. They concede (Petryshyn et al. 2011) that what may look like cell boundaries are likely optical features due to the growth habit of the crystals and write: “If these samples are indeed the remains of complex animals, the mode of preservation has obscured the original fine cellular detail.”

Evidently, the case for these fossils preserving the anatomy of a bilaterian animal is now more cryptic. Nevertheless, Petryshyn et al. (2011) speculate that the sections of the *Vernanimalcula* types are thinner, 15 μm (they are 50 μm according to Chen, Bottjer, et al. 2004), than ordinary 30 μm thick petrographic sections and

therefore may show primary cellular boundaries. Furthermore, they write: “The question is – what was originally phosphatized? Was it a decomposing complex metazoan, or a random collection of abiotic matter? We believe that the answer to this lies in the repetition of this form ... it seems unlikely that the circumstances of rapid abiotic precipitation of phosphate would produce the same complex morphology at the same scales repeatedly. It is therefore more likely that these structures are the remnants of a Neoproterozoic bilaterally symmetrical organism”. This argument, however, sets up a classical false dichotomy by presenting a choice between two unlikely extreme alternatives that leaves out the proposed interpretation (Bengtson and Budd 2004; Xiao et al. 2010) that the objects are diagenetically mineralized, decayed microfossils.

At several intervals in the Doushantuo Formation, millimetre-scale spherical fossils are literally rock-forming. All of these fossils, from the most to the least remarkably preserved, show evidence of void-filling diagenetic mineralization after soft tissues have decayed (Cunningham et al. 2012). In many of these fossils, the generations of mineralization give the appearance of bilateral symmetry in the chance orientation of randomly oriented planes of section, as our examples from embryo-like and acritarch fossils demonstrate (Fig. 4). Chen, Bottjer, et al. (2004) reported the examination of 50,000 microfossils in thin sections, and so it is not unexpected that they identified such specimens; it is perhaps more surprising that they found so few. The recurrence of size and shape that so convinced Petryshyn et al. (2011) of the biogenic basis of the bilateral structure seen in *Vernanimalcula* fossils reflects the fact that almost all of the fossils in these horizons have the same approximate size and cross-sectional

shape. This is a documented phenomenon, reflecting size-sorting and grading at the time of sedimentation, after initial fossilization elsewhere (Xiao and Knoll 2000).

ENTERING THE THIRD DIMENSION

The entire concept of *Vernanimalcula guizhouena* is based on fifteen thin sections, one from each of fifteen individual fossils, the anatomy of which is otherwise entirely unknown. Ten of these were rock sections described by Chen et al. (Chen, Bottjer, et al. 2004; Chen, Oliveri, et al. 2004). The other five were made from isolated specimens without prior observation of their three-dimensional morphology (Petryshyn et al. 2011). In all, ten sections of *Vernanimalcula* have been figured, and these all show approximate bilateral symmetry in the occurrence of paired cavities within centripetally layered walls, surrounding a core of botryoidal structures.

It is important to note that there is no prior reason to interpret the fossil remains of *Vernanimalcula* as bilaterian. The fossils approach bilateral symmetry in the plane of section, but no insights are provided into the relationship of that plane of section to the fossil organism. It may seem glib, but it is important to remember that these are slivers of rock; they may preserve, through mineral replication, features of the biological structure of a once living organism, but that has to be demonstrated, not assumed a priori without justification. Similarly, the interpretative model, in light of which anatomical homologies are to be identified in the fossil remains, must be justified a priori, or else the conclusions are at risk of circular reasoning (Bengtson 1986; Donoghue and Purnell 2009).

When the general affinity of a fossil is unknown, the safest approach is to first determine the intrinsic geometric properties of the remains, taking taphonomy and diagenesis into account. Indeed, the best test of a hypothesis that the bilateral disposition of structures in *Vernanimalcula* reflects a bilateral organism is to reconstruct anatomy based on the geometric relations between structures preserved in the specimens. This is possible only if the available evidence includes 3-dimensional information, in this case represented by a number of sections in different planes and at different angles.

Chen and colleagues (Chen, Bottjer, et al. 2004; Chen, Oliveri, et al. 2004; Petryshyn et al. 2011) assert that all sections of different individuals represent a coronal, or approximately coronal, plane. Thus, although the sections were un-oriented, no transverse, sagittal, etc., sectional planes through the allegedly bilateral body were discovered. However, without knowledge of the 3-dimensional anatomy, derived from intersecting planes, it is impossible to determine the orientation of the planes of section, e.g., as coronal or approximately coronal, let alone their relationship to one another. Conversely, without knowledge of the orientation and level of the plane of section even the presence of two separate “coelomic” cavities cannot be ascertained (cf. Fig. 4D–G). In sum, the anatomical reconstruction of *Vernanimalcula* cannot be derived from the available data.

In contrast to the original specimens of *Vernanimalcula*, which were selected among 50,000 other specimens in rock sections, new specimens reported by Petryshyn et al. (2011) were isolated from the rock by chemical preparation prior to analysis. The specimens were found in phosphatic clasts, but unfortunately no

attempt was made to use X-ray tomographic microscopy (e.g., Donoghue et al. 2006; Hagadorn et al. 2006; Chen et al. 2009) to analyze the full morphology of the “small bilaterian” before sectioning, to discover whether it was in fact bilaterally symmetrical, with a creeping sole, ventral mouth, peripherally placed sensory organs, etc. Thus no evidence now remains for the 3-dimensional morphology that would have provided a critical test of the *Vernanimalcula* hypothesis. In Fig. 4 we give examples of how *Vernanimalcula*-like morphologies may appear in sections of microfossils of known 3-dimensional structure. Apparently, one source of such morphologies is semi-degraded specimens of *Tianzhushania* (cyst-forming protists, cf. Hultgren et al. 2011) in the two- or four-cell stage of cleavage (Fig. 4A–C).

Evidently, the interpretation of *Vernanimalcula* as a bilaterian rests on an assertion based on little more than the approximately bilateral arrangement of cavities seen in the sectioned fossils. The anatomical reconstruction is without foundation.

EPISTEMOLOGY OF A SMALL BILATERIAN

“There is a bilaterian in that truck” – Chen Jun-Yuan quoted in Bottjer (2005)

The short history of research into *Vernanimalcula guizhouena* reminds us of the pitfalls, not merely of the interpretation of fossils, but of comparative anatomy more generally. The identification of anatomical homologies occurs within the context of a phylogenetic hypothesis – yet those interpreted homologies are then marshalled as evidence of phylogenetic affinity (Rieppel and Kearney 2007). The

only means of escaping this circular logic is to establish an evidential basis for the phylogenetic milieu within which homologies are to be identified. Since anatomical homologies are ultimately based in the relations between parts, this is best achieved by establishing the geometric properties of intrinsic anatomical characters, seen through the filter of taphonomy.

The fossils referred to *Vernanimalcula guizhouena* can be rationalised on the bodyplan of a bilaterian animal, but only if it is assumed a priori that they represent the remains of a bilaterian animal. There is no intrinsic evidence to justify this interpretative model, however. The available evidence indicates little more than the fact that these objects are approximately circular in cross-section and filled with generations of void-filling mineral deposited after the internal biological structure intrinsic to the organism had decayed. There is no evidence for a bilaterian animal, or even an animal, interpretation.

It is likely that the fossils referred to *Vernanimalcula* were interpreted as bilaterians because this was, as our epigram betrays, the explicit quarry of its authors. If you know from the beginning not only what you are looking for, but what you are going to find, you will find it, whether or not it exists. As Richard Feynman (1974) famously remarked: “The first principle is that you must not fool yourself – and you are the easiest person to fool. ... After you've not fooled yourself, it's easy not to fool other scientists.”

Conversely, once you have fooled yourself you will fool other scientists. And so *Vernanimalcula* has been marshalled in evidential support for the timing of bilaterian evolution and of multifarious bilaterian innovations. The “little spring

animal” has taken on a life of its own, a life it never had in the Neoproterozoic. It is our hope that *Vernanimalcula* will now be laid to a merciful rest, freed from the heavy burden of undue evolutionary significance that has hitherto been heaped upon it.

Acknowledgements

X-ray tomographic microscopy was conducted at the X02DA (TOMCAT) beamline of the Swiss Light Source, Paul Scherrer Institute, Villigen, Switzerland, and we are grateful to Marco Stampanoni and Federica Marone for support and assistance at the beamline. Our work has been supported by the Swedish Research Council (VR, Grants 2007-4484 and 2010-3929 to SB), the Natural Environment Research Council (NERC, Grant NE/F00348X/1 to PCJD), and the National Natural Science foundation of China (NNSF, Grant 41072005 to CY).

REFERENCES

- Bengtson, S. 1986. The problem of the Problematica. In *Problematic Fossil Taxa*, edited by A. Hoffman and M. H. Nitecki. New York: Oxford U.P.
- Bengtson, S. and Budd, G. 2004. Comment on "Small bilaterian fossils from 40 to 55 million years before the Cambrian". *Science* 306:1291a.
- Bottjer, D. 2005. The early evolution of animals. *Scientific American* 293 (2):42–47.
- Briggs, D. E. G. 2003. The role of decay and mineralization in the preservation of soft-bodied fossils. *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences* 31:275–301.
- Chen, J.-Y., Bottjer, D. J., Davidson, E. H., Li, G., Gao, F., Cameron, R. A., Hadfield, M. G., Xian, D.-C., Tafforeau, P., Jia, Q.-J., Sugiyama, H., and

- Tang, R. 2009. Phase contrast synchrotron X-ray microtomography of Ediacaran (Doushantuo) metazoan microfossils: Phylogenetic diversity and evolutionary implications. *Precambrian Research* 173:191–200.
- Chen, J.-Y., Bottjer, D. J., Oliveri, P., Dornbos, S. Q., Gao, F., Ruffins, S., Chi, H., Li, C.-W., and Davidson, E. H. 2004. Small bilaterian fossils from 40 to 55 million years before the Cambrian. *Science* 305:218–222.
- Chen, J.-Y., Oliveri, P., Davidson, E. H., and Bottjer, D. J. 2004. Response to comment on "Small bilaterian fossils from 40 to 55 million years before the Cambrian". *Science* 306:1291b.
- Corballis, M. C. 2009. The evolution and genetics of cerebral asymmetry. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society. B. Biological Sciences* 364:867–879.
- Cunningham, J. A., Thomas, C.-W., Bengtson, S., Kearns, S. L., Xiao, S., Marone, F., Stampanoni, M., and Donoghue, P. C. J. 2012. Distinguishing geology from biology in the Ediacaran Doushantuo biota constrains the origin of bilaterians. *Proceedings of the Royal Society. B. Biological Sciences* online:8 pp.
- Donoghue, P. C. J., Bengtson, S., Dong, X.-p., Gostling, N., J., Huldtgren, T., Cunningham, J. A., Yin, C., Yue, Z., Peng, F., and Stampanoni, M. 2006. Synchrotron X-ray tomographic microscopy of fossil embryos. *Nature* 442:680–683.
- Donoghue, P. C. J. and Purnell, M. A. 2009. Distinguishing heat from light in debate over controversial fossils. *BioEssays* 31 (2):178–189.
- Feynman, R. P. 1974. Cargo cult science. *Engineering and Science* 37 (7):10–13.

Giere, O. 2009. *Meiobenthology. The Microscopic Motile Fauna of Aquatic Sediments*.

2nd Ed. ed. Berlin: Springer.

Hagadorn, J. W., Xiao, S., Donoghue, P. C. J., Bengtson, S., Gostling, N., J., Pawlowska, M., Raff, E. C., Raff, R. A., Turner, F. R., Yin, C., Zhou, C., Yuan, X., McFeely, M. B., Stampanoni, M., and Nealson, K. H. 2006.

Cellular and subcellular structure of Neoproterozoic animal embryos.

Science 314:291–294.

Huldtgren, T., Cunningham, J., Yin, C., Stampanoni, M., Marone, F., Donoghue, P. C. J., and Bengtson, S. 2011. Fossilized nuclei and germination

structures identify Ediacaran ‘animal embryos’ as encysting protists.

Science 334 (6063):1696–1699.

Isaak, M. 2007. *The Counter-Creationism Handbook*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Liu P., Yin C., Tang F., Gao L., and Wang Z. 2007. [Progresses and questions on studying metazoan fossils of the Weng’an biota.]. *Geological Review* 53 (6):728–735.

Nilsson, D.-E. 2004. Eye evolution: a question of genetic promiscuity. *Current Opinion in Neurobiology* 14:407–414.

Petryshyn, V. A., Bottjer, D. J., Chen, J.-Y., and Gao, F. 2011. Petrographic analysis of new specimens of the putative microfossil *Vernanimalcula guizhouena* (Doushantuo Formation, South China). *Precambrian Research*, online. DOI: 10.1016/j.precamres.2011.08.003.

Raff, E. C., Schollaert, K. L., Nelson, D. E., Donoghue, P. C. J., Thomas, C.-W., Turner, F. R., Stein, B. D., Dong, X., Bengtson, S., Huldtgren, T.,

- Stampanoni, M., Yin, C., and Raff, R. A. 2008. Embryo fossilization is a biological process mediated by microbial biofilms. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 105 (49):19360–19365.
- Rieppel, O. and Kearney, M. 2007. The poverty of taxonomic characters. *Biology and Philosophy* 22:95–113.
- Sarnat, H. B. 2008. Embryology and malformations of the forebrain commissures. In *Handbook of Clinical Neurology*, edited by H. B. Sarnat and P. Curatolo: Elsevier.
- Sarnat, H. B. and Flores-Sarnat, L. 2005. Normal development of the nervous system. In *Pediatric Neuropsychiatry*, edited by C. E. Coffey and R. A. Brumback: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.
- Saul, J. M. and Schwartz, L. 2007. Cancer as a consequence of the rising level of oxygen in the Late Precambrian. *Lethaia* 40 (3):211–220.
- Schiffbauer, J. D., Xiao, S., Sharma, K. S., and Wang, G. 2012. The origin of intracellular structures in Ediacaran metazoan embryos. *Geology* 40 (3):223–226.
- Vargas, A. O. and Aboitiz, F. 2005. How ancient is the adult swimming capacity in the lineage leading to Euchordates? *Evolution and Development* 7 (3):171–174.
- Xiao, S. and Knoll, A. 2000. Phosphatized animal embryos from the Neoproterozoic Doushantuo Formation at Weng'an, Guizhou, south China. *Journal of Paleontology* 74 (5):767–788.

- Xiao, S. and Knoll, A. H. 2000. Fossil preservation in the Neoproterozoic Doushantuo phosphorite Lagerstätte, South China. *Lethaia* 32 [year of imprint 1999] (3):219–240.
- Xiao, S., Kowalewski, M., Shen, B., Dong, L., and Laflamme, M. 2009. The rise of bilaterians: a reply. *Historical Biology* 21 (3–4):239–246.
- . 2010. The rise of bilaterians: a few closing comments . *Historical Biology* 22 (4):433–436.
- Xiao, S. and Schiffbauer, J. D. 2008. Microfossil phosphatization and its astrobiological implications. In *From Fossils to Astrobiology*, edited by J. Seckbach and M. Walsh.
- Xiao S., Zhang Y., and Knoll, A. 1998. Three-dimensional preservation of algae and animal embryos in a Neoproterozoic phosphorite. *Nature* 391 (6667):553–558.

FIGURE CAPTIONS

Fig. 1. Reconstruction of *Vernanimalcula guizhouena*. Artwork Amadeo Bachar (www.abachar.com). From Bottjer (2005).

Fig. 2. Tomographic renderings (2-dimensional slices) of globular microfossil from the Doushantuo Formation, Weng'an, Guizhou. SMNH 4825. Note presence of early diagenetic cryptocrystalline apatite replacing organic tissue, as well as later diagenetic banded, spherulitic void-filling apatite (cf. the fabric in Fig. 3A and C).

Fig. 3. *Vernanimalcula guizhouena* Chen, Bottjer, Oliveri, Dornbos, Gao, Ruffins, Chi, Li & Davidson, 2004, holotype (A, B; X00305) and paratype (C, D; X08981). Microphotographs of thin sections (A, C) and interpretative drawings (B, D) from Chen, Bottjer et al. (2004; reprinted with permission from AAAS); our additions are the rings and arrows in A, C to emphasize diagenetic features, as well as labels and arrows in B, D, representing Chen, Bottjer et al.'s (2004) interpretations of bilaterian biological characters.

The features indicating that the alleged cell layers represent successive generations of diagenetic overgrowth of apatite (Bengtson and Budd 2004) are: (1) regular banding of color and thickness that can be followed around the circumferences of the cavities but differs between specimens; (2) spherulitic fans radiating from irregularities on the overgrown surfaces (examples marked by bluish rings in A and C), (3) cavity-filling geometry, in particular the meeting of opposing spherulites (red arrows in A) and the absence of the last-formed layer in narrow spaces (red arrow in C); and (4) fibronormal texture of the bands, revealed as lineations and cracks that form “cell boundaries” that frequently persist across “cell layers” (examples marked by white arrows in A and C). Every “cell layer” and “organ” drawn in B and D corresponds to fibronormal apatite bands and concentric spherulites, respectively, in the actual specimens. A further alleged biological feature (Chen, Oliveri, et al. 2004), “inward bilateral ridges in the floor of the coelomic cavities”, corresponds to the meeting and intergrowth of opposing spherulites marked by red arrows in A.

Fig. 4. *Vernanimalcula*-like sections through microfossils from the Doushantuo Formation, Weng'an, Guizhou. A–C. Specimen of *Tianzhushania* (Museum of

Earth Science, Institute of Geology, Chinese Academy of Geological Sciences MESIG 10025) before (A) and after (B, C) embedding and thin-sectioning (A and B from Liu et al. 2007). Frame in B shows position of C. The “bilateral symmetry” of this specimen appears to result from the plane of section passing through two partly degraded cells of an early cleavage stage. D–G. Tomographic renderings of a *Tianzhushania* (D, E; Swedish Museum of Natural History SMNH X 4826) and a *Meghystrichosphaeridium* (F, G; SMNH X 4827). D and F are volumetric renderings of thin slices about 3 μm thick at levels of apparent bilateral symmetry. E and G show sections and 2-dimensional slices at different levels through the fossils; “bilateral symmetry” is not a persistent feature in the specimens. Diagenetic void-filling apatite forms banding and spherulitic features in C and D (cf. the spherulites in Fig. 3A and C). Lighter colors in tomographic slices correspond to higher X-ray attenuation.

A100 μm **B**100 μm

Bengtson, S., Cunningham, J.A., Yin, C. and Donoghue, P.C.J. 2012: A merciful death for the “earliest bilaterian”, *Vernanimalcula*. Supporting Information.

Table 1. List of papers citing Chen, J.-Y., Bottjer, D. J., Oliveri, P., Dornbos, S. Q., Gao, F., Ruffins, S., Chi, H., Li, C.-W., and Davidson, E. H. 2004. Small bilaterian fossils from 40 to 55 million years before the Cambrian. *Science* 305:218–222. The three right-hand columns indicate whether the reference was (–) negative, i.e. critical of the interpretation of *Vernanimalcula* as an animal fossil, (0) neutral, citing the controversy but not taking a strong stand, or (+) positive, accepting *Vernanimalcula* as an early bilaterian animal. Of the 139 papers in the list, 17 are negative, 28 neutral, and 94 positive. A search through Google Scholar (2012-02-26) indicates 161 papers citing Chen et al. 2004, but some of these are not regular publications, some have misunderstood the claim for bilaterian fossils, and some we have not seen. These papers were excluded from the list.

2004			
Bengtson, S. and Budd, G. 2004. Comment on “Small bilaterian fossils from 40 to 55 million years before the Cambrian”. <i>Science</i> 306 (5700).	–		
Cameron, R. A. 2004. Hunting for origins. <i>Science</i> 305 (5684):613–614.			+
Chen, J. Y., Oliveri, P., Davidson, E., and Bottjer, D. J. 2004. Response to Comment on “Small bilaterian fossils from 40 to 55 million years before the Cambrian”. <i>Science</i> 306 (5700).			+
Douzery, E. J. P., Snell, E. A., Baptiste, E., Delsuc, F., and Philippe, H. 2004. The timing of eukaryotic evolution: Does a relaxed molecular clock reconcile proteins and fossils? <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America</i> 101 (43):15386–15391.			+
McDonald, J. M., Siegal, G. P., and Eisemann, M. G. 2004. Evolutionary change and The American Journal of Pathology. <i>American Journal of Pathology</i> 165 (4):1055–1056.			+
Nilsson, D.-E. 2004. Eye evolution: a question of genetic promiscuity. <i>Current Opinion in Neurobiology</i> 14:407–414.			+
2005			
Bengtson, S. 2005. Mineralized skeletons and early animal evolution. In <i>Evolving Form and Function: Fossils and Development</i> , edited by D. E. G. Briggs. New Haven, CT: Yale Peabody Museum.	–		
Blair, J. E. and Hedges, S. B. 2005. Molecular clocks do not support the Cambrian explosion. <i>Molecular Biology and Evolution</i> 22 (3):387–390.			+
Blair, J. E. and Hedges, S. B. 2005. Molecular phylogeny and divergence times of deuterostome animals. <i>Molecular Biology and Evolution</i> 22 (11):2275–2284.			+
Bottjer, D. J. 2005. Geobiology and the fossil record: eukaryotes, microbes, and their interactions. <i>Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology</i> 219 (1–2):5–21.			+
Chen, J. Y. and Chi, H. M. 2005. Precambrian phosphatized embryos and larvae from the Doushantuo Formation and their affinities, Guizhou (SW China). <i>Chinese Science Bulletin</i> 50 (19):2193–2200.			+

Chu, X. L., Todt, W., Zhang, Q. R., Chen, F. K., and Huang, J. 2005. U-Pb zircon age for the Nanhua-Sinian boundary. <i>Chinese Science Bulletin</i> 50 (7):716–718.			+
Cohen, B. L. 2005. Not armour, but biomechanics, ecological opportunity and increased fecundity as keys of the origin and expansion of the mineralized benthic metazoan fauna. <i>Biological Journal of the Linnean Society</i> 85 (4):483–490.			+
Condon, D., Zhu, M. Y., Bowring, S., Wang, W., Yang, A. H., and Jin, Y. G. 2005. U-Pb ages from the neoproterozoic Doushantuo Formation, China. <i>Science</i> 308 (5718):95–98.			+
Dornbos, S. Q., Bottjer, D. J., Chen, J. Y., Oliveri, P., Gao, F., and Li, C. W. 2005. Precambrian animal life: Taphonomy of phosphatized metazoan embryos from southwest China. <i>Lethaia</i> 38 (2):101–109.			+
Jenner, R. A. and Littlewood, D. T. J. 2008. Problematica old and new. <i>Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society. B. Biological Sciences</i> 363 (1496):1503–1512.		0	
Kaufman, A. J. 2005. The calibration of Ediacaran time. <i>Science</i> 308 (5718):59–60.			+
Kimura, H., Azmy, K., Yamamuro, M., Jiang, Z. W., and Cizdziel, J. V. 2005. Integrated stratigraphy of the upper Neoproterozoic succession in Yunnan Province of South China: Re-evaluation of global correlation and carbon cycle. <i>Precambrian Research</i> 138 (1–2):1–36.			+
Liu, P. J. and Yin, C. Y. 2005. New data of phosphatized acritarchs from the Ediacaran Doushantuo Formation at Weng'an, Guizhou Province, southwest China. <i>Acta Geologica Sinica-English Edition</i> 79 (5):575–581.		0	
Martin, D., Briggs, D. E. G., and Parkes, R. J. 2005. Decay and mineralization of invertebrate eggs. <i>Palaeos</i> 20 (6):562–572.			+
Paxton, H. 2005. Molting polychaete jaws - ecdysozoans are not the only molting animals. <i>Evolution & Development</i> 7 (4):337–340.			+
Sarnat, H. B. and Flores-Sarnat, L. 2005. Normal development of the nervous system. In <i>Pediatric Neuropsychiatry</i> , edited by C. E. Coffey and R. A. Brumback: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.			+

Shen, Y., Zhang, T. G., and Chu, X. L. 2005. C-isotopic stratification in a Neoproterozoic postglacial ocean. <i>Precambrian Research</i> 137 (3-4):243-251.			+
Shu, D. G. 2005. On the Phylum Vetulicolia. <i>Chinese Science Bulletin</i> 50 (20):2342-2354.		0	
Vargas, A. O. and Aboitiz, F. 2005. How ancient is the adult swimming capacity in the lineage leading to Echinodermata? <i>Evolution & Development</i> 7 (3):171-174.			+
2006			
Baker, M. E. 2006. The genetic response to Snowball Earth: role of HSP90 in the Cambrian explosion. <i>Geobiology</i> 4 (1):11-14.			+
Bottjer, D. J. and Clapham, M. E. 2006. Evolutionary paleoecology of Ediacaran benthic marine animals. In <i>Neoproterozoic Geobiology and Paleobiology</i> , edited by S. Xiao and A. J. Kaufman. Dordrecht: Springer.			+
Broitman-Maduro, G., Lin, K. T.-H., Hung, W. W. K., and Maduro, M. F. 2006. Specification of the C. elegans MS blastomere by the T-box factor TBX-35. <i>Development</i> 133:3097-3106.			+
Chen, J. Y., Bottjer, D. J., Davidson, E. H., Dornbos, S. Q., Gao, X., Yang, Y. H., Li, C. W., Li, G., Wang, X. Q., Xian, D. C., Wu, H. J., Hwu, Y. K., and Tafforeau, P. 2006. Phosphatized polar lobe-forming embryos from the Precambrian of Southwest China. <i>Science</i> 312 (5780):1644-1646.			+
Chi, H. and Xiao, Z. 2006. The fluorescent character of the precambrian microfossils. Edited by G. L. Z. T. H. Zhou, <i>Progress on Post-Genome Technologies</i> .			+
Chi, H., Xiao, Z., Fu, D., and Lu, Z. 2006. Analysis of fluorescence from algae fossils of the Neoproterozoic Doushantuo Formation of China by confocal laser scanning microscope. <i>Microscopy Research and Technique</i> 69 (4):253-259.			+
Conway Morris, S. 2006. Darwin's dilemma: the realities of the Cambrian 'explosion'. <i>Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. B Biological Sciences</i> 361:1069-1083.	-		
Cornec, J.-P. and Gilles, A. 2006. Urbilateria, a complex organism? <i>M S-Medecine Sciences</i> 22 (5):493-501.			+
Davidson, E. H. 2006. <i>The Regulatory Genome: Gene Regulatory Networks in Development and Evolution</i> . Burlington, MA: Academic Press.			+
Donoghue, P. C. J., Bengtson, S., Dong, X.-P., Gostling, N. J., Hultgren, T., Cunningham, J. A., Yin, C., Yue, Z., Peng, F., and Stampani, M. 2006. Synchrotron X-ray tomographic microscopy of fossil embryos. <i>Nature</i> 442 (7103):680-683.	-		
Dornbos, S. Q., Bottjer, D. J., Chen, J. Y., Gao, F., Oliveri, P., and Li, C. W. 2006. Environmental controls on the taphonomy of phosphatized animals and animal embryos from the neoproterozoic doushantuo formation, Southwest China. <i>Paleos</i> 21 (1):3-14.			+
Douzery, E. J. P., Delsuc, F., and Philippe, H. 2006. Molecular dating in the genomic era. <i>M S-Medecine Sciences</i> 22 (4):374-380.			+
Halverson, G. 2006. A Neoproterozoic chronology. In <i>Neoproterozoic Geobiology and Paleobiology</i> , edited by S. Xiao and A. J. Kaufman. Dordrecht: Springer.			+
Hedges, S. B., Battistuzzi, F. U., and Blair, J. E. 2006. Molecular timescale of evolution in the Proterozoic. In <i>Neoproterozoic Geobiology and Paleobiology</i> , edited by S. Xiao and A. J. Kaufman. Dordrecht: Springer.		0	
Howard-Ashby, M., Materna, S. C., Brown, C. T., Tu, Q., Oliveri, P., Cameron, R. A., and Davidson, E. H. 2006. High regulatory gene use in sea urchin embryogenesis: Implications for bilaterian development and evolution. <i>Developmental Biology</i> 300:27-34.			+
Lankenau, D.-H. 2006. Germline double-strand break repair and gene targeting in <i>Drosophila</i> : a trajectory system throughout evolution. <i>Genome Integrity</i> 1:153-197.			+
Liang, M.-C., Hartman, H., Kopp, R. E., Kirschvink, J. L., and Yung, Y. L. 2006. Production of hydrogen peroxide in the atmosphere of a Snowball Earth and the origin of oxygenic photosynthesis. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America</i> 103 (50):18896-18899.			+
Liu, P. and Yin, C. 2006. Enigmatic microtunnels – the drag marks of pyrites on the phosphatized spheroidal fossils from Sinian Doushantuo Formation at Weng'an, Guizhou Province. <i>Geological Review</i> 52 (1):11-14.		0	
Liu, P., Yin, C., and Tang, F. 2006. Discovery of the budding phosphatized globular fossils from the Neoproterozoic Doushantuo Formation at Weng'an, Guizhou Province, China. <i>Progress in Natural Science</i> 16 (10):1079-1083.			+
Liu, P. J., Yin, C. Y., and Tang, F. 2006. Microtubular metazoan fossils with multi-branches in Weng'an Biota. <i>Chinese Science Bulletin</i> 51 (5):630-632.		0	
Lopez-Garcia, P., Moreira, D., Douzery, E., Forterre, P., Van Zuijlen, M., Claeys, P., and Prieur, D. 2006. Ancient fossil record and early evolution (ca. 3.8 to 0.5 Ga). <i>Earth Moon and Planets</i> 98 (1-4):247-290.			+
Maduro, M. F. 2006. Endomesoderm specification in Caenorhabditis elegans and other nematodes. <i>Bioessays</i> 28 (10):1010-1022.			+
Maia, A. M. 2006. A invenção do avião. <i>Revista do Instituto geográfico e histórico da Bahia</i> 101:21-40.			+
Meysman, F. J. R., Middelburg, J. J., and Heip, C. H. R. 2006. Bioturbation: a fresh look at Darwin's last idea. <i>Trends in Ecology and Evolution</i> 21 (12):688-695.		0	
Moroz, L. L., Edwards, J. R., Puthanveetil, S. V., Kohn, A. B., Ha, T., Heyland, A., Knudsen, B., Sahni, A., Yu, F., Liu, L., Jezzini, S., Lovell, P., Iannuccelli, W., Chen, M., Nguyen, T., Sheng, H., Shaw, R., Kalachikov, S., Panchin, Y. V., Farmerie, W., Russo, J. J., Ju, J., and Kandel, E. R. 2006. Neuronal transcriptome of Aplysia: neuronal compartments and circuitry. <i>Cell</i> 127:1453-1467.			+
Seipel, K. and Schmid, V. 2006. Mesodermal anatomies in cnidarian polyps and medusae. <i>International Journal of Developmental Biology</i> 50:589-599.			+
Zhang, X., Hua, H., and Reitner, J. 2006. A new type of Precambrian megascopic fossils: the Jinxian biota from northeastern China. <i>Facies</i> 52 (1):169-181.		0	
2007			
Bailey, J. V., Joye, S. B., Kalanetra, K. M., Flood, B. E., and Corsetti, F. A. 2007. Evidence of giant sulphur bacteria in Neoproterozoic phosphorites. <i>Nature</i> 445 (7124):198-201.		0	
Benton, M. J. and Donoghue, P. C. J. 2007. Paleontological evidence to date the Tree of Life. <i>Molecular Biology and Evolution</i> 24 (1):26-53.	-		
Chen, J., Waloszek, D., Maas, A., Braun, A., Huang, D., Wang, X., and Stein, M. 2007. Early Cambrian Yangtze Plate Maotianshan Shale macrofauna biodiversity and the evolution of predation. <i>Palaogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology</i> 254 (1-2):250-272.		0	
Chi, H., Xiao, Z., Chen, J., and Lu, Z. 2007. Application of atomic force microscopy on observing the ultra-fine structure of the Neoproterozoic microfossils from China. <i>Scanning</i> 29 (3):102-108.			+
Chi, H. M., Xiao, Z. D., and Xiao, X. X. 2007. The nano membrane-like structure of the Precambrian microfossils under atomic force microscope (AFM). In <i>Nanoscience and Technology, Pts 1 and 2</i> , edited by C. X. S. Z. X. Bai.			+
Gaidos, E., Dubuc, T., Dunford, M., McAndrew, P., Padilla-Gamio, J., Studer, B., Weersing, K., and Stanley, S. 2007. The Precambrian emergence of animal life: a geobiological perspective. <i>Geobiology</i> 5 (4):351-373.		0	
Gostling, N. J., Donoghue, P. C. J., and Bengtson, S. 2007. The earliest fossil embryos begin to mature. <i>Evolution and Development</i> 9:206-207.	-		

Hurlbut, G. D., Kankel, M. W., Lake, R. J., and Artavanis-Tsakonas, S. 2007. Crossing paths with Notch in the hyper-network. <i>Current Opinion in Cell Biology</i> 19 (2):166-175.			+
Isaak, M. 2007. <i>The Counter-Creationism Handbook</i> . Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.			+
Li, C.-W., Chen, J.-Y., Lipps, J. H., Gao, F., Chi, H.-M., and Wu, H.-J. 2007. Ciliated protozoans from the Precambrian Doushantuo Formation, Wengan, South China. <i>Geological Society, London, Special Publications</i> 286:151-156.			+
Liu, P., Yin, C., Tang, F., Gao, L. and Wang, Z. 2007. Progresses and questions on studying metazoan fossils of the Weng'an biota. <i>Geological Review</i> 53 (6):728-735.	-		
Rieu, R., Allen, P. A., Cozzi, A., Kosler, J., and Bussy, F. 2007. A composite stratigraphy for the Neoproterozoic Huqf Supergroup of Oman: integrating new litho-, chemo- and chronostratigraphic data of the Mirbat area, southern Oman. <i>Journal of the Geological Society, London</i> 164 (5):997-1009.			+
Sarkar, S. 2007. <i>Doubting Darwin?: Creationist Designs on Evolution</i> . Blackwell.			+
Saul, J. M. and Schwartz, L. 2007. Cancer as a consequence of the rising level of oxygen in the Late Precambrian. <i>Lethaia</i> 40 (3):211-220.			+
Weber, B., Steiner, M., and Zhu, M.-Y. 2007. Precambrian-Cambrian trace fossils from the Yangtze Platform (South China) and the early evolution of bilaterian lifestyles. <i>Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology</i> 254 (1-2):328-349.			+
Wehner, R. d., Fukushi, T., and Isler, K. 2007. On being small: brain allometry in ants. <i>Brain, Behavior and Evolution</i> 69 (3):220-228.			+
Yang, Q., Ma, J., Sun, X., and Cong, P. 2007. Phylochronology of early metazoans: combined evidence from molecular and fossil data. <i>Geological Journal</i> 42:281-295.			+
Yin, L. and Yuan, X. 2007. Radiation of Meso-Neoproterozoic and early Cambrian protists inferred from the microfossil record of China. <i>Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology</i> 254:350-361.	0		
Yin, L., Zhu, M., Knoll, A. H., Yuan, X., Zhang, J., and Hu, J. 2007. Doushantuo embryos preserved inside diapause egg cysts. <i>Nature</i> 446 (7136):661-663.	0		
Zhang, X.-G. 2007. Phosphatized bradoriids (Arthropoda) from the Cambrian of China. <i>Palaeontographica Abteilung a-Palaeozoologie-Stratigraphie</i> 281 (4-6):93-+.	0		
Zhou, C., Xie, G., Mcfadden, K., Xiao, S., and Yuan, S. 2007. The diversification and extinction of Doushantuo-Pertatataka acritarchs in South China: causes and biostratigraphic significance. <i>Geological Journal</i> 42:229-262.	-		
Zhu, M., Zhang, J., and Yang, A. 2007. Integrated Ediacaran (Sinian) chronostratigraphy of South China. <i>Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology</i> 2007:7-61.			+
2008			
Bailey, J. V. 2008. <i>New perspectives on ancient microbes and microbialites: From isotopes to immunology</i> . Ph.D. Thesis, Department of Geological Sciences, University of Southern California.		0	
Campbell, T. G. 2008. <i>Analysis of Glycerol 3-phosphate Dehydrogenase and Sarco/endoplasmic Reticulum Calcium Ion Channel Atpase for Use in Deep Metazoan Phylogenetics</i> . Ph.D. Thesis, Department of Biology, University of South Florida.			+
Chi, H., Feng, M., Xia, Z., and Lu, Z. 2008. Preservation and fluorescence of the microfossils from Neoproterozoic Doushantuo Formation. <i>Microscopy Research and Technique</i> 71 (4):260-266.			+
Corballis, M. C. 2008. Of mice and men - and lopsided birds. <i>Cortex</i> 44 (1):3-7.			+
Etter, W. 2008. Patterns of diversification and extinction. In <i>Handbook of Paleozoology</i> , edited by W. Henke and I. Tattersall. Berlin: Springer.	-		
Jaśkowski, W. and Komosiński, M. 2008. The numerical measure of symmetry for 3D stick creatures. <i>Artificial Life</i> 14 (4):425-443.			+
Jenner, R. A. and Littlewood, D. T. J. 2008. Problematica old and new. <i>Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences</i> 363 (1496):1503-1512.		0	
Li, Y., Guo, J., Zhang, X., Zhang, W., Liu, Y., Yang, W., Li, Y., Liu, L., and Shu, D. 2008. Vase-shaped microfossils from the Ediacaran Weng'an biota, Guizhou, South China. <i>Gondwana Research</i> 14 (1-2):263-268.		0	
Lieberman, B. S. 2008. The Cambrian radiation of bilaterians: Evolutionary origins and palaeontological emergence; earth history change and biotic factors. <i>Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology</i> 258 (3):180-188.			+
Liu, P., Xiao, S., Yin, C., Zhou, C., Gao, L., and Tang, F. 2008. Systematic description and phylogenetic affinity of tubular microfossils from the Ediacaran Doushantuo Formation at Weng'an, South China. <i>Palaeontology</i> 51:339-366.		0	
Matz, M. V., Frank, T. M., Marshall, N. J., Widder, E. A., and Johnsen, S. 2008. Giant Deep-Sea Protist Produces Bilaterian-like Traces. <i>Current Biology</i> 18 (23):1849-1854.		0	
Sarnat, H. B. 2008. Embryology and malformations of the forebrain commissures. In <i>Handbook of Clinical Neurology</i> , edited by H. B. Sarnat and P. Curatolo: Elsevier.			+
Sawaki, Y., Ohno, T., Fukushi, Y., Komiya, T., Ishikawa, T., Hirata, T., and Maruyama, S. 2008. Sr isotope excursion across the Precambrian-Cambrian boundary in the Three Gorges area, South China. <i>Gondwana Research</i> 14 (1-2):134-147.			+
Shen, Y., Zhang, T., and Hoffman, P. F. 2008. On the coevolution of Ediacaran oceans and animals. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America</i> 105 (21):7376-7381.			+
Shu, D. 2008. Cambrian explosion: Birth of tree of animals. <i>Gondwana Research</i> 14 (1-2):219-240.			+
Xiao, S. and Schiffbauer, J. D. 2008. Microfossil phosphatization and its astrobiological implications. In <i>From Fossils to Astrobiology</i> , edited by J. Seckbach and M. Walsh.	-		
2009			
Adams, J. 2009. <i>Local-scale patterns in species richness, Species Richness: Patterns in the Diversity of Life</i> .			+
Beaumont, N. J. 2009. Modelling the Transport of Nutrients in Early Animals. <i>Evolutionary Biology</i> 36 (2):256-266.		0	
Chen, J.-Y., Bottjer, D. J., Davidson, E. H., Li, G., Gao, F., Cameron, R. A., Hadfield, M. G., Xian, D.-C., Tafforeau, P., Jia, Q.-J., Sugiyama, H., and Tang, R. 2009. Phase contrast synchrotron X-ray microtomography of Ediacaran (Doushantuo) metazoan microfossils: Phylogenetic diversity and evolutionary implications. <i>Precambrian Research</i> 173 (1-4):191-200.			+
Chen, J.-Y., Bottjer, D. J., Li, G., Hadfield, M. G., Gao, F., Cameron, R. A., Zhang, C.-Y., Xian, D.-C., Tafforeau, P., Liao, X., and Yin, Z.-J. 2009. Complex embryos displaying bilaterian characters from Precambrian Doushantuo phosphate deposits, Weng'an, Guizhou, China. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America</i> 106 (45):19056-19060.			+
Chen, J.-Y. 2009. The sudden appearance of diverse animal body plans during the Cambrian explosion. <i>International Journal of Developmental Biology</i> 53 (5-6):733-751.			+
Chen, Y.-Q., Jiang, S.-Y., Ling, H.-F., and Yang, J.-H. 2009. Pb-Pb dating of black shales from the Lower Cambrian and Neoproterozoic strata, South China. <i>Chemie Der Erde-Geochemistry</i> 69 (2):183-189.			+
Chi, H., Feng, M., Chen, Y., Ding, C., Gu, L., Ma, J., and Lu, Z. 2009. The apatite crystal in fossil cells with fluorescence. <i>Crystal Growth & Design</i> 9 (2):676-681.		0	
Corballis, M. C. 2009. The evolution and genetics of cerebral asymmetry. <i>Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences</i> 364 (1519):867-879.			+

Donoghue, P. C. J. and Purnell, M. A. 2009. Distinguishing heat from light in debate over controversial fossils. <i>Bioessays</i> 31 (2):178-189.	-				+
Freeman, G. 2009. The rise of bilaterians. <i>Historical Biology</i> 21 (1-2):99-114.					+
Giere, O. 2009. <i>Meiobenthology. The Microscopic Motile Fauna of Aquatic Sediments</i> . 2nd Ed. ed. Berlin: Springer.					+
Gostling, N. J., Dong, X., and Donoghue, P. C. J. 2009. Ontogeny and taphonomy: an experimental taphonomy study of the development of the brine shrimp <i>Artemia salina</i> . <i>Palaeontology</i> 52:169-186.	-				
Liu, P.-j., Yin, C.-y., Chen, S.-m., Tang, F., and Gao, L.-z. 2009. New data of phosphatized globular fossils from Weng'an biota in the Ediacaran Doushantuo Formation and the problem concerning their affinity. <i>Acta Geoscientica Sinica</i> 30 (4):457-464.	-				
Nielsen, C. 2009. How did indirect development with planktotrophic larvae evolve? <i>Biological Bulletin</i> 216 (3):203-215.		0			
Phoenix, C. 2009. Cellular differentiation as a candidate "new technology" for the Cambrian Explosion. <i>Journal of Evolution and Technology</i> 20 (2):43-48.					+
Rozhnov, S. V. 2009. Development of the trophic structure of Vendian and Early Paleozoic Marine communities. <i>Paleontological Journal</i> 43 (11):1364-1377.					+
Sanz, J. L. 2009. Fósiles, cultura e historia de la vida. In <i>El alcance del darwinismo. A los 150 años de la publicación de "El origen de las especies"</i> . edited by C. López-Fanjul. Madrid: Colegio Libre de Eméritos.					+
Saul, J. M. 2009. Did detoxification processes cause complex life to emerge? <i>Lethaia</i> 42 (2):179-184.					+
Schopf, J. W. and Bottjer, D. J. 2009. World summit on ancient microscopic fossils Preface. <i>Precambrian Research</i> 173 (1-4):1-3.					+
Telford, M. J. and Littlewood, D. T. J. 2009. <i>Animal Evolution: Genomes, Fossils, and Trees</i> . Oxford: Oxford UP.		0			
Thiem, S. M. 2009. Baculovirus genes affecting host function. <i>In Vitro Cellular & Developmental Biology-Animal</i> 45 (3-4):111-126.					+
Vannier, J. 2009. The Cambrian explosion and the emergence of modern ecosystems. <i>Comptes Rendus Palevol</i> 8 (2-3):133-154.					+
Wang, X. and Shi, X. 2009. Spatio-temporal carbon isotope variation during the Ediacaran period in South China and its impact on bio-evolution. <i>Science in China Series D-Earth Sciences</i> 52 (10):1520-1528.					+
Xiao, S., Kowalewski, M., Shen, B., Dong, L., and Laflamme, M. 2009. The rise of bilaterians: a reply. <i>Historical Biology</i> 21 (3-4):239-246.	-				
Yin, Z.-J., Zhu, M.-Y., and Xiao, T.-Q. 2009. Application of synchrotron X-ray microtomography in paleontology for non-destructive 3-D imaging of fossil specimens. <i>Physics</i> 38 (7):504-510.		0			
2010					
Davidson, E. H. and Erwin, D. H. 2010. An integrated view of Precambrian eumetazoan evolution. <i>Cold Spring Harbor Symposia on Quantitative Biology</i> 74:65-80.					+
de Riquelès, A. 2010. On Darwin's palaeontology in The Origin of Species. <i>Comptes Rendus Biologies</i> 333 (2):87-94.					+
Dunthorn, M., Lipps, J. H., and Stoeck, T. 2010. Reassessment of the Putative Ciliate Fossils <i>Eotintinnopsis</i> , <i>Wujiangella</i> , and <i>Yonyangella</i> from the Neoproterozoic Doushantuo Formation in China. <i>Acta Protozoologica</i> 49 (2):139-144.		0			
Farmer, M. A. and Habura, A. 2010. Using Protistan Examples to Dispel the Myths of Intelligent Design. <i>Journal of Eukaryotic Microbiology</i> 57 (1):3-10.					+
Freeman, G. 2010. Comment on Xiao et al. (2009), response to: the rise of bilaterians. <i>Historical Biology</i> 22 (4):430-432.					+
Sawaki, Y., Ohno, T., Tahata, M., Komiya, T., Hirata, T., Maruyama, S., Windley, B. F., Han, J., Shu, D., and Li, Y. 2010. The Ediacaran radiogenic Sr isotope excursion in the Doushantuo Formation in the Three Gorges area, South China. <i>Precambrian Research</i> 176 (1-4):46-64.					+
Schaefer, I., Norton, R. A., Scheu, S., and Maraun, M. 2010. Arthropod colonization of land – Linking molecules and fossils in oribatid mites (Acari, Oribatida). <i>Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution</i> 57:113-121.					+
Xiao, S., Kowalewski, M., Shen, B., Dong, L., and Laflamme, M. 2010. The rise of bilaterians: a few closing comments. <i>Historical Biology</i> 22 (4):433-436.	-				
Zhang, Y., Zhan, R., Fan, J., Cheng, J., and Liu, X. 2010. Principal aspects of the Ordovician biotic radiation. <i>Science China-Earth Sciences</i> 53 (3):382-394.					+
Zhao, Y.-Y. and Zheng, Y.-F. 2010. Stable isotope evidence for involvement of deglacial meltwater in Ediacaran carbonates in South China. <i>Chemical Geology</i> 271 (1-2):86-100.					+
2011					
Erwin, D. H., Laflamme, M., Tweedt, S. M., Sperling, E. A., Pisani, D., and Peterson, K. J. 2011. The Cambrian Conundrum: Early divergence and later ecological success in the early history of animals. <i>Science</i> 334 (6059):1091-1097.		0			
Hultgren, T., Cunningham, J., Yin, C., Stapanoni, M., Marone, F., Donoghue, P. C. J., and Bengtson, S. 2011. Fossilized nuclei and germination structures identify Ediacaran 'animal embryos' as encysting protists. <i>Science</i> 334 (6063):1696-1699.	-				
Kah, L. C. and Bartley, J. K. 2011. Protracted oxygenation of the Proterozoic biosphere. <i>International Geology Review</i> 53 (11-12):1424-1442.					+
Kano, A., Kunimitsu, Y., Togo, T., Takashima, C., Shiraishi, F., and Wang, W. 2011. Evolution of animal multicellularity stimulated by dissolved organic carbon in early Ediacaran ocean: DOXAM hypothesis. <i>Island Arc</i> 20 (2):280-293.					+
Lin, Z., Wang, Q., Feng, D., Liu, Q., and Chen, D. 2011. Post-depositional origin of highly (13)C-depleted carbonate in the Doushantuo cap dolostone in South China: Insights from petrography and stable carbon isotopes. <i>Sedimentary Geology</i> 242 (1-4):71-79.					+
Petryshyn, V. A., Bottjer, D. J., Chen, J.-Y., and Gao, F. 2011. Petrographic analysis of new specimens of the putative microfossil <i>Vernanimalcula guizhouena</i> (Doushantuo Formation, South China). <i>Precambrian Research</i> in press.					+
Rehm, P., Borner, J., Meusemann, K., von Reumont, B. M., Simon, S., Hadrys, H., Misof, B., and Burmester, T. 2011. Dating the arthropod tree based on large-scale transcriptome data. <i>Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution</i> 61 (3):880-887.					+
Schaefer, I.-M., Schueler, P., Enders, C., Scharf, J.-G., Cameron, S., Ramadori, G., and Fuezesi, L. 2011. High chromosomal instability in adenocarcinoma of the ileum arising from multifocal gastric heterotopia with gastritis cystica profunda. <i>Medical Oncology</i> 28 (4):1023-1026.					+
Sehrbunt, M. 2011. <i>Wie die blinde Evolution das Sehen erfand</i> . Hamburg: Books on Demand, Norderstedt.					+
Yin, Z., Zhu, M., Tafforeau, P., Chen, J., Liu, P., and Li, G. 2011. Early embryogenesis of potential bilaterian animals with polar lobe formation from the Ediacaran Weng'an Biota, South China. <i>Precambrian Research</i> online:14 pp.				0	
Zhu, M., Lu, M., Zhang, J., Zhao, F., Li, G., Aihua, Y., Zhao, X., and Zhao, M. 2011. Carbon isotope chemostratigraphy and sedimentary facies evolution of the Ediacaran Doushantuo Formation in western Hubei, South China. <i>Precambrian Research</i> online:22 pp.				0	
2012					
Corballis, M. C. 2012. Lateralization of the human brain. In <i>Progress in Brain Research</i> , edited by M. A. Hofman and D. Falk. Amsterdam: Elsevier.					+
Cunningham, J. A., Thomas, C.-W., Bengtson, S., Kearns, S. L., Xiao, S., Marone, F., Stapanoni, M., and Donoghue, P. C. J., 2012. Distinguishing geology from biology in the Ediacaran Doushantuo biota constrains the origin of bilaterians. <i>Proceedings of the Royal Society. B. Biological Sciences</i> , online:8 pp.	-				